

# JAMA<sup>®</sup>

The Journal of the American Medical Association  
106 Years of Continuous Publication

**Editor:** George D. Lundberg, MD  
**Deputy Editor:** Richard M. Glass, MD  
**Deputy Editor (West):** Drummond Rennie, MD  
**Senior Editors:** Helene M. Cole, MD, Don Riesenber, MD  
**Senior Contributing Editors:** Bruce B. Dan, MD, M. Therese Southgate, MD  
**Contributing Editors:** Charles B. Clayman, MD, David S. Cooper, MD, Harriet S. Meyer, MD, Carin M. Olson, MD, Jody W. Zylke, MD  
**Consulting Editor:** Roger C. Bone, MD  
**Statistical Editor:** Naomi Vaisrub, PhD  
**Morris Fishbein Fellow:** Jeanette M. Smith, MD  
**Assistant to the Editor:** Annette Flanagin  
**Medical News—Editor:** Phil Gunby; **Associate Editors:** Paul Cotton, Marsha F. Goldsmith, Charles Marwick (Washington, DC), Teri Randall, Andrew Skolnick  
**Associate Editors:** Charlene Breedlove, Roxanne K. Young  
**Special Assignments Editor:** Dennis L. Breo  
**Editorial Services Manager:** Elaine Williams  
**Production Manager:** Marlene M. Hirsch  
**Assistant Production Managers:** John R. Sayban, Mary C. Steermann  
**Electronic Manager:** Nawin Gupta  
**Editorial Processing Manager:** Cheryl Iverson  
**Assistant Editorial Processing Manager:** Paula Giltman  
**Permissions and Graphic Design Manager:** Dennis J. Shipley  
**Staff Assistants:** Diane Darnell, Bonnie Van Clevon  
**Electronic Coordinator:** Mary Ellen McGrain  
**Production Supervisors:** Lori A. Barba (Copy Editing), Thomas J. Handrigan (Illustrations), John R. Sayban (Advertising), JoAnne Weiskopf (Layout)  
**Copy Editing:** Vickie Golden (Free-lance Coordinator), Paul Frank (Senior Copy Editor), Lisa Cluver, Daniel Halibey, Richard T. Porter, Jerri Schwartz, Jennifer Sperry  
**Proofreading:** Teresa H. Orniotek, Jennifer Reiling, Barbara Wojtowicz  
**Production Associate:** Susan Price  
**Senior Production Assistants:** Melinda Arcabos, Laura Bleiler, Karen Branham, Cynthia Gelper, Jerri Hall-Gortowski, Anita Henderson, Debra Lucas, Susan L. McIlwaine, Dorothy Patterson, E. Ruth White  
**Production Assistants:** Brenda Chandler, Sandra Sanders  
**Illustrations and Layout:** Cari Biamonte, Juliana K. Mills  
**Cover Editor:** M. Therese Southgate, MD  
**Editorial Coordinator:** Lenette Williams  
**Editorial Supervisors:** Steve Sarang, Gale Saulsberry  
**Administrative Assistant:** Michele Bacuros  
**Editorial Assistants:** Mary Cannon, Kimberly Evans, Anne Frecka, Helen M. Giese, Shirley Goines, Sharon Iverson, Andrea Kanter, Mary Ann Lilly, Ethel Pinkston, Dorothy White, Helga Wutz  
**Electronic Input Specialist:** Vee Bailey  
**Scientific and Socioeconomic Indexing Department:** Norman Frankel (Director), George Kruto, Susan McClelland, Mary Kay Tinerella

All articles published, including editorials, letters, and book reviews, represent the opinions of the authors and do not reflect the official policy of the American Medical Association or the institution with which the author is affiliated, unless this is clearly specified.

**JAMA, The Journal of the American Medical Association** (ISSN 0098-7484), is published four issues per month by the American Medical Association, 535 N Dearborn St, Chicago, IL 60610. Phone (312) 645-5000. Cable address "Medic" Chicago.

**SUBSCRIPTION RATES**—The subscription rate per year for members of the AMA is \$2 included in the annual membership dues. The subscription rate per year for nonmembers is \$69 for 1 year, \$123 for 2 years in the United States and US possessions; in all other countries, 1 year, \$86; 2 years, \$157 (add \$40 surcharge to each 1-year subscription and \$80 surcharge to each 2-year subscription for air delivery available to most countries). Rates to US medical students and residents, \$34.50 for 1 year, \$61.50 for 2 years in the United States and US possessions. Rates for subscriptions for delivery to Japan or South Korea are available through respective exclusive agents. Address all subscription communications to American Medical Association, Circulation and Fulfillment Division, 535 N Dearborn St, Chicago, IL 60610. Phone: (312) 280-7168.

**CHANGE OF ADDRESS**—POSTMASTER, send all address changes to JAMA, The Journal of the American Medical Association, attention: Subscription Department, 535 N Dearborn St, Chicago, IL 60610. Notification of address change must be made at least 6 weeks in advance; include both old and new addresses, a recent mailing label, and your new zip code. Second-class postage paid at Chicago and additional mailing office.

JAMA<sup>®</sup> Registered in the US Patent and Trademark Office.  
Copyright © 1990 by the  
American Medical Association 

March 9, 1990, Vol 263, No. 10

To promote the science and art of medicine and the betterment of the public health.

## The Cover

The artwork for this issue is a departure from the original art that usually graces JAMA's covers. For the first time, we feature a computer-generated graphic, a scrutinizing eye, symbolizing both the process of editorial peer review and the examination peer review underwent during The First International Congress on Peer Review in Biomedical Publication.

## Editorial Peer Review in Biomedical Publication: The First International Congress

D. Rennie, San Francisco, Calif

1317

## Peer Review in 18th-Century Scientific Journalism

D. A. Kronick, San Antonio, Tex

1321

## The Evolution of Editorial Peer Review

J. C. Burnham, Columbus, Ohio

1323

## The Communities of Scientists and Journal Peer Review

E. Knoll, Los Angeles, Calif

1330

## Who Are the Peer Reviewers and How Much Do They Review?

A. Yankauer, Worcester, Mass

1338

## What Do Peer Reviewers Do?

S. Lock, J. Smith, London, England

1341

## Editorial Peer Review in US Medical Journals

A. C. Weller, Chicago, Ill

1344

## Variation in Journal Peer Review Systems

L. L. Hargens, Urbana, Ill

1348

## Quotational and Reference Accuracy in Surgical Journals

J. T. Evans, East Meadow, NY; H. I. Nadjari, Macon, Ga; S. A. Burchell, Charleston, SC

1353

## An Exploratory Study of Statistical Assessment of Papers Published in the *British Medical Journal*

M. J. Gardner, J. Bond, Southampton, England

1355

## Problems Identified by Secondary Review of Accepted Manuscripts

J. M. Garfunkel, M. H. Ulshen, H. J. Hamrick, E. E. Lawson, Chapel Hill, NC

1369

## The Effects of Blinding on the Quality of Peer Review

R. A. McNutt, A. T. Evans, R. H. Fletcher, S. W. Fletcher, Chapel Hill, NC, and Philadelphia, Pa

1371

## Effect of Acceptance or Rejection on the Author's Evaluation of Peer Review of Medical Manuscripts

J. M. Garfunkel, E. E. Lawson, H. J. Hamrick, M. H. Ulshen, Chapel Hill, NC

1376

1311

**The Existence of Publication Bias and Risk Factors for Its Occurrence** ..... 1385  
K. Dickersin, Baltimore, Md

**What Can and Should Be Done to Reduce Publication Bias?** ..... 1390  
D. W. Sharp, London, England

**Minimizing the Three Stages of Publication Bias** ..... 1392  
T. C. Chalmers, C. S. Frank, Boston, Mass; D. Reitman, New York, NY

**A Cohort Study of Summary Reports of Controlled Trials** ..... 1401  
I. Chalmers, Oxford, England; M. Adams, Boston, Mass; K. Dickersin, Baltimore, Md; J. Hetherington, W. Tarnow-Mordi, Oxford, England; C. Meinert, S. Tonascia, Baltimore, Md; T. C. Chalmers, Boston, Mass

**Underreporting Research Is Scientific Misconduct** ..... 1405  
I. Chalmers, Oxford, England

**Correcting the Literature Following Fraudulent Publication** ..... 1416  
P. J. Friedman, San Diego, Calif

**The Continued Use of Retracted, Invalid Scientific Literature** ..... 1420  
M. P. Pfeifer, G. L. Snodgrass, Louisville, Ky

**The Impact of Fraudulent Research on the Scientific Literature** ..... 1424  
E. Garfield, A. Williams-Dorof, Philadelphia, Pa

**Biomedical Information, Peer Review, and Conflict of Interest as They Influence Public Health** ..... 1427  
E. I. Cantekin, T. W. McGuire, R. L. Potter, Pittsburgh, Pa

**Comparison of Research Quality Guidelines in Academic and Nonacademic Environments** ..... 1435  
J. J. Nobel, Plymouth Meeting, Pa

**The Philosophical Basis of Peer Review and the Suppression of Innovation** ..... 1438  
D. F. Horrobin, Kentville, Canada

**Classified Advertising** ..... 1445

**CME Corner** ..... 1456

**Index to Advertisers** ..... 1456

**JAMA Journal Club Reading Assignments** ..... 1456

**Instructions for Authors** ..... See February 9, 1990, p 785.

## Reference Directories

**US Meetings**, February 2; **Organizations of Medical Interest**, January 12; **State Associations and Examinations and Licensure**, January 19; **Meetings Outside the United States**, January 26; **AMA Officials**, August 18

1312 JAMA, March 9, 1990—Vol 263, No. 10

# JAMA<sup>®</sup>

The Journal of the American Medical Association

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Kenneth A. Arndt, MD, Boston, Mass  
Byron J. Bailey, MD, Galveston, Tex  
Robert J. Blendon, ScD, Boston, Mass  
James E. Dalen, MD, Tucson, Ariz  
Lois DeBakey, PhD, Houston, Tex  
R. Gordon Douglas, Jr, MD, New York, NY  
William H. Foege, MD, Atlanta, Ga  
Renee C. Fox, PhD, Philadelphia, Pa  
Daniel X. Freedman, MD, Los Angeles, Calif  
Vincent A. Fulginiti, MD, New Orleans, La  
Morton F. Goldberg, MD, Baltimore, Md  
Marilyn Heins, MD, Tucson, Ariz  
King K. Holmes, MD, PhD, Seattle, Wash  
Harold G. Jacobson, MD, Bronx, NY  
Robert J. Joynnt, MD, PhD, Rochester, NY  
Mark S. Litwin, MD, Boston, Mass  
Gordon K. MacLeod, MD, Pittsburgh, Pa  
Daniel J. McCarty, MD, Milwaukee, Wis  
William W. McLendon, MD, Chapel Hill, NC  
Arno G. Motulsky, MD, Seattle, Wash  
Claude H. Organ, Jr, MD, Oakland, Calif  
Edmund D. Pellegrino, MD, Washington, DC  
Robert E. Rakel, MD, Houston, Tex  
Thomas P. Stossel, MD, Boston, Mass

## INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Prof Luigi Allegra, JAMA-Italy  
Dr Michèle Deker, JAMA-France  
Yuichiro Goto, MD JAMA-Japan  
Dr J. K. Jain, JAMA-India  
Prof Dr Med Max Just, JAMA-Switzerland  
Prof Dr Ivan Lambic, JAMA-Yugoslavia  
Yong Kak Lee, MD, FACS JAMA-South Korea  
Dr Mehmet Pekus, JAMA-Turkey  
Azam Soorma, MBBS, JAMA-Pakistan  
Prof David Todd, JAMA-Southeast Asia  
Dr Zhang Hongkai, JAMA-People's Republic of China  
Dr Pierre-Francois Unger, JAMA-Switzerland

## AMA Officers

**President:** Alan R. Nelson, MD\*  
**President-Elect:** C. John Tupper, MD\*  
**Immediate Past President:** James E. Davis, MD  
**Secretary-Treasurer:** Jerald R. Schenken, MD\*  
**Speaker, House of Delegates:** John L. Clowe, MD  
**Vice-Speaker, House of Delegates:** Daniel H. Johnson, Jr, MD

## AMA Trustees

Lonnie R. Bristow, MD; Rufus K. Broadaway, MD; Mary Ann Contogiannis, MD (Resident); John H. Dawson, MD; Nancy W. Dickey, MD; Ray W. Gifford, Jr, MD; Alan C. Hartford (Student); William E. Jacott, MD; Robert E. McAfee, MD\*; Joseph T. Painter, MD\* (Vice-Chairman); John J. Ring, MD\* (Chairman); Raymond Scalettar, MD\*; Jerald R. Schenken, MD\* (Secretary); Frank B. Walker, MD

\*Executive Committee

**Acting Executive Vice President:** James S. Todd, MD

**Deputy Executive Vice President:** Kenneth E. Monroe

**Senior Vice President:** Thomas F. Hannon

**Vice President, Publishing:** John T. Baker

**Vice President, Scientific Information:** George D. Lundberg, MD

**Director, Publication Production and Printing Division:** Norman D. Richey

**Director, Advertising Sales and Promotion Services Division:** Dennis Joseph Dennehy

**Director, Circulation-Fulfillment Division:** Lee A. Parent

**Director, Advertising Communications:** Thomas J. Carroll

**Director, Advertising Services:** Raymond Christian

**ADVERTISING OFFICES:** Eastern: 600 Third Ave, Suite 700, New York, NY 10016 (Manager: Robert C. Corcoran [212-867-6640]); Representatives: Alice Harvey-Herman, Cliff Vanderhoof; Midwest/Farwest: 535 N Dearborn St, Chicago, IL 60610 (Manager: Thomas J. Carroll [312-280-7182]); Representative: Daniel T. Mjolsness; Classified Advertising: Michele Hanrahan (312-280-7190)

**ADVERTISING PRINCIPLES**—Advertisements in this issue have been reviewed to comply with the principles governing advertising in AMA publications. A copy of these principles is available on request. The appearance of advertising in AMA publications is not an AMA guarantee or endorsement of the product or the claims made for the product by the manufacturer.