

EDITORIAL STAFF

Editor: George D. Lundberg, MD
Deputy Editor: Richard M. Glass, MD
Deputy Editor (West): Drummond Rennie, MD
Senior Editors: Phil B. Fontanarosa, MD, Margaret A. Winker, MD
Senior Contributing Editor: M. Therese Southgate, MD
Contributing Editors: Charles B. Clayman, MD, Helene M. Cole, MD, Thomas B. Cole, MD, MPH, David S. Cooper, MD, David H. Mark, MD, MPH, Harriet S. Meyer, MD, Carin M. Olson, MD, Ronna Henry Siegel, MD, Jeanette M. Smith, MD, Jody W. Zytko, MD
Consulting Editors: Robert A. Clark, MD, Deborah J. Cook, MD
Statistical Editor: Naomi Vaisrub, PhD
Associate Senior Editor: Annette Flanagin
Associate Editors: Charlene Breedlove, Roxanne K. Young
Fishbein Fellow: Thomas C. Jefferson, MD
Medical News & Perspectives: Marsha F. Goldsmith (editor); Charles Marwick, Mike Mitka, Andrew Skolnick, Joan Stephenson, PhD (associate editors); Rebecca Voelker (contributing editor)
Assistant Editor: Juliana M. Walker

EDITORIAL BOARD

Daniel M. Albert, MD, Madison, Wis
Kenneth A. Arndt, MD, Boston, Mass
H. David Banta, MD, Amsterdam, the Netherlands
Jack D. Barchas, MD, New York, NY
Michael Berger, MD, Düsseldorf, Germany
Robert J. Blendon, ScD, Boston, Mass
Marjorie A. Bowman, MD, MPA, Philadelphia, Pa
James E. Dalen, MD, Tucson, Ariz
Catherine D. DeAngelis, MD, Baltimore, Md
Lois DeBaakey, PhD, Houston, Tex
Ronald G. Evens, MD, St Louis, Mo
Michael E. Johns, MD, Atlanta, Ga
Colin I. Johnston, MB,BS, Melbourne, Australia
Donald A. B. Lindberg, MD, Bethesda, Md
Hervé Maisonneuve, MD, Paris, France
Kenneth D. McClatchey, MD, DDS, Maywood, Ill
Quan Dong Nguyen, MD, Boston, Mass
Claude H. Organ, Jr, MD, Oakland, Calif
Edmund D. Pellegrino, MD, Washington, DC
Reed E. Pyeritz, MD, PhD, Pittsburgh, Pa
Uwe E. Reinhardt, PhD, Princeton, NJ
Povl Riis, MD, Copenhagen, Denmark
William L. Roper, MD, MPH, Chapel Hill, NC
Roger N. Rosenberg, MD, Dallas, Tex
Masaaki Terada, MD, Tokyo, Japan

INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Bassel Atallah, MD, JAMA—Middle East
Mauro Bologna, MD, JAMA—Italy
Yuichiro Goto, MD, JAMA—Japan
Evin Kantemir, MD, JAMA—Turkey
A. J. Khan, SI, FRCP, JAMA—Pakistan
Jin-Pok Kim, MD, JAMA—Korea
C. R. Kumana, MBBS, JAMA—Southeast Asia
Li Chengyi, MD, JAMA—China
Alexandra Livaditou, MD, JAMA—Greece
Maria S. P. da Silva, MD, JAMA—Brazil
Miguel Vilardell Tarres, MD, JAMA—Spain
Ivan Vidmar, MD, JAMA—Slovenia
Jiří Widimský, MUDr, DrSc, JAMA—Czech/Slovak

JAMA (ISSN 0098-7484) is published weekly by the American Medical Association, except for 4 combined issues in months with 5 Wednesdays. Address: 515 N State St, Chicago, IL 60610.

SUBSCRIPTION RATES—The subscription rate for AMA members (\$20 per year) is included in and is not deductible from the annual AMA membership dues. The annual subscription rates for nonmembers are \$145 in the United States and US possessions, \$195 in the Americas, and £125 outside the Americas. The rate for nonmember medical students and resident physicians is \$48 in the United States. The annual institution rates are \$245 in the United States, \$345 in the Americas, and £195 outside the Americas. Address all subscription communications to Subscriber Services Center, American Medical Association, PO Box 10946, Chicago, IL 60610-0946. Phone: (800) 262-2350; fax: (312) 464-5831; e-mail: ama-subs@ama-assn.org.

CHANGE OF ADDRESS—POSTMASTER, send all address changes to: JAMA, The Journal of the American Medical Association, attention: Subscription Department, PO Box 10946, Chicago, IL 60610. Notification of address change must be made at least 6 weeks in advance; include both old and new addresses and a recent mailing label. Periodicals postage paid at Chicago and at additional mailing offices. GST Registration Number: 12622 5556 RT.

JAMA[®] Registered in the US Patent and Trademark Office.
 Copyright[®] 1998 by the
 American Medical Association



Editorials

- Congress on Biomedical Peer Review: History, Ethics, and Plans for the Future** 213
 D. Rennie, A. Flanagin, Chicago, Ill
- Peer Review in Prague** 214
 D. Rennie, Chicago, Ill

Authorship

- Authorship: The Coin of the Realm, The Source of Complaints** 216
 L. J. Wilcox, Boston, Mass
- What Are the Factors Determining Authorship and the Order of the Authors' Names? A Study Among Authors of the *Nederlands Tijdschrift voor Geneeskunde* (*Dutch Journal of Medicine*)** 217
 W. P. Hoen, H. C. Walvoort, A. J. P. M. Overbeke, Amsterdam, the Netherlands
- Multiple Authorship: The Contribution of Senior Authors** 219
 J. P. H. Drenth, Nijmegen, the Netherlands

- Prevalence of Articles With Honorary Authors and Ghost Authors in Peer-Reviewed Medical Journals** 222
 A. Flanagin, Chicago, Ill; L. A. Carey, New York, NY; P. B. Fontanarosa, Chicago, Ill; S. G. Phillips, Hackensack, NJ; B. P. Pace, G. D. Lundberg, D. Rennie, Chicago, Ill

Conflict of Interest

- Financial Interest and Its Disclosure in Scientific Publications** 225
 S. Krimsky, Medford, Mass; L. S. Rothenberg, Los Angeles, Calif

Quality of Peer Review

- Changes to Manuscripts During the Editorial Process: Characterizing the Evolution of a Clinical Paper** 227
 G. P. Purcell, Durham, NC; S. L. Donovan, F. Davidoff, Philadelphia, Pa
- Reliability of Editors' Subjective Quality Ratings of Peer Reviews of Manuscripts** 229
 M. L. Callahan, San Francisco, Calif; W. G. Baxt, Philadelphia, Pa; J. F. Waeckerle, Kansas City, Mo; R. L. Wears, Jacksonville, Fla
- What Makes a Good Reviewer and a Good Review for a General Medical Journal?** 231
 N. Black, S. van Rooyen, F. Godlee, R. Smith, S. Evans, London, England
- Effect of Blinding and Unmasking on the Quality of Peer Review: A Randomized Trial** 234
 S. van Rooyen, F. Godlee, S. Evans, R. Smith, N. Black, London, England
- Effect on the Quality of Peer Review of Blinding Reviewers and Asking Them to Sign Their Reports: A Randomized Controlled Trial** 237
 F. Godlee, London, England; C. R. Gale, C. N. Martyn, Southampton, England
- Does Masking Author Identity Improve Peer Review Quality? A Randomized Controlled Trial** 240
 A. C. Justice, Cleveland, Ohio; M. K. Cho, Philadelphia, Pa; M. A. Winker, Chicago, Ill; J. A. Berlin, Philadelphia, Pa; D. Rennie, San Francisco, Calif; and the PEER Investigators
- Masking Author Identity in Peer Review: What Factors Influence Masking Success?** 243
 M. K. Cho, Philadelphia, Pa; A. C. Justice, Cleveland, Ohio; M. A. Winker, Chicago, Ill; J. A. Berlin, Philadelphia, Pa; J. F. Waeckerle, Kansas City, Mo; M. L. Callahan, D. Rennie, San Francisco, Calif; and the PEER Investigators

Bias

US and Non-US Submissions: An Analysis of Reviewer Bias 246
A. M. Link, Bethesda, Md

Adherence to Published Standards of Reporting: A Comparison of Placebo-Controlled Trials Published in English or German 247
C. A. Junker, Berne, Switzerland

Publication Bias and Research on Passive Smoking: Comparison of Published and Unpublished Studies 250
A. L. Misakian, L. A. Bero, San Francisco, Calif

Positive-Outcome Bias and Other Limitations in the Outcome of Research Abstracts Submitted to a Scientific Meeting 254
M. L. Callahan, San Francisco, Calif; R. L. Wears, Gainesville, Fla;
E. J. Weber, San Francisco, Calif; C. Barton, Chapel Hill, NC;
G. Young, San Francisco, Calif

Unpublished Research From a Medical Specialty Meeting: Why Investigators Fail to Publish 257
E. J. Weber, M. L. Callahan, San Francisco, Calif; R. L. Wears, Jacksonville, Fla;
C. Barton, Chapel Hill, NC; G. Young, San Francisco, Calif

Is There a Sex Bias in Choosing Editors? Epidemiology Journals as an Example 260
K. Dickersin, L. Fredman, Baltimore, Md; K. M. Flegal, Hyattsville, Md;
J. D. Scott, B. Crawley, Baltimore, Md

Reviewing the Reviews: The Example of Chronic Fatigue Syndrome 264
J. Joyce, S. Rabe-Hesketh, S. Wessely, London, England

Improving Quality

Can the Accuracy of Abstracts Be Improved by Providing Specific Instructions? A Randomized Controlled Trial 267
R. M. Pitkin, M. A. Branagan, Los Angeles, Calif

Reporting of Randomized Clinical Trial Descriptors and Use of Structured Abstracts 269
R. W. Scherer, B. Crawley, Baltimore, Md

Perceived Value of Providing Peer Reviewers With Abstracts and Preprints of Related Published and Unpublished Papers 273
C. L. Hatch, Bethesda, Md; S. N. Goodman, Baltimore, Md

Evaluating the *BMJ* Guidelines for Economic Submissions: Prospective Audit of Economic Submissions to *BMJ* and *The Lancet* 275
T. Jefferson, R. Smith, London, England; Y. Yee, M. Drummond, York, England;
M. Pratt, R. Gale, London, England

Methodology and Reports of Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses: A Comparison of Cochrane Reviews With Articles Published in Paper-Based Journals 278
A. R. Jadad, D. J. Cook, Hamilton, Ontario, Canada;
A. Jones, T. P. Klassen, P. Tugwell, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada;
M. Moher, Oxford, England; D. Moher, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada

Discussion Sections in Reports of Controlled Trials Published in General Medical Journals: Islands in Search of Continents? 280
M. Clarke, I. Chalmers, Oxford, England

Research Design and Statistical Methods in Chinese Medical Journals 283
Q. Wang, B. Zhang, Shanghai, China

JAMA[®]

The Journal of the American Medical Association

SCIENTIFIC INFORMATION AND MULTIMEDIA STAFF

Medical News and New Media Division: William M. Silberg (editorial director); Renée Roberts (manager, editorial graphics); Marty Suter (associate editor); Deborah Flapan, Neal Shankman (assistant editors); Maria A. Hall (staff assistant)

Editorial Systems and Administration: Elaine Williams (director), Vee Bailey (electronic input supervisor), Veronica Campos, Lenette Gardner-Gullens (electronic input specialists)

Administrative Assistant: Helga Fritz
Editorial Assistants: Linda Baker, Patricia Joworski, Gale Saulsberry (group supervisors); Kemberly Evans (letters coordinator); Mary Cannon, Susan Collister, Audrey Forman, Shirley Gogins, Gwenn Gregg, Lisa Hardin, Carmina Landeros, Mary Ann Lilly, Christina Myers, Kathie Owens, Ethel Pinkston, Raul Serrato, Gloria Tate

Editorial Processing Division: Cheryl Iverson (director), Diane L. Cannon (freelance manager), Connie Manno (freelance coordinator), Paul Frank (electronic editing specialist), Monica Mungie (assistant electronic editing specialist)

Copy Editing: Laura King (director); Susan R. Benner, Jane C. Lantz (senior copy editors); Coleen Adamson, Joy Jaeger, Brande Martin, Beverly Stewart

PRODUCTION AND DISTRIBUTION STAFF

Production and Distribution Division: Vanessa Hayden (director), Diane Darnell (publishing manufacturing analyst), Bonnie Van Clevon (manager, budgets and costs), Karen Adams-Taylor (director, advertising and production), Linda Knott (director, electronic production), Paul Gasiecki (manager, distribution)

Managers: Phil Arko (composition), Mary Ellen Johnston (database and new media), Teresa Omiotek (proofreading), Carole Piszker (advertising), Susan Price (print production), Charl Richey (color and graphics)

Proofreaders: David Antos, Daniel James, Mary Kay Tinerella, Barbara Wojtowicz

Production Associates and Operators: Joseph Amft, Gail Barrett, Karen Branham, Victoria Buckner, Debbie Camp, Brenda Chandler, La'son J. Diggs, Shannon Epplett, Amy Evers, Betty Frigerio, Kathy Gaydar, Mari Guizzetti, Mary Ann Kuranda, Sandra Lopez, Michael McGraw, Melanie Parenti, Sarah Powell, Jeni Reiling, Jo Anne Turner, Carmela Ware, JoAnne Weiskopf, Alicja Wojcik-Dunn

Production Assistant: Ruth Sprague

CIRCULATION AND CONTENT MARKETING STAFF

Director, Division of Circulation and Content Marketing: James A. Skowrenski

Circulation Processing: Beverly Martin (director)

Circulation Development: Bina Oza (director)

Licensing and Permissions: Norman Frankel (director), Ada Jimenez-Walker (permissions)

Reprint Coordinator: Joseph Rekash

AMA Officers

President: Nancy W. Dickey, MD*

President-Elect: Thomas R. Reardon, MD*

Immediate Past President: Percy Wootton, MD

Secretary-Treasurer: Timothy T. Flaherty, MD*

Speaker, House of Delegates: Richard F. Corlin, MD

Vice-Speaker, House of Delegates: John A. Knotte, MD

AMA Trustees

Herman I. Abramowitz, MD; Susan Hershberg Adelman, MD; Yank D. Coble, MD*; Palma E. Formica, MD; J. Edward Hill, MD; Donald T. Lewers, MD* (Vice Chair); William H. Mahood, MD; John C. Nelson, MD*; Donald J. Palmisano, MD, JD; William G. Plested III, MD; Bruce A. Scott, MD (Young Physician); Randolph D. Smoak, Jr, MD* (Chair); Andrew M. Thomas, MD (Resident); Jeffrey A. Towson (Student).

*Executive Committee.

AMA EXECUTIVE STAFF

Executive Vice President, Chief Executive Officer:

E. Ratcliffe Anderson, Jr, MD

Chief Operating Officer: Lynn Jensen, PhD

Editor in Chief, Scientific Information and Multimedia:

George D. Lundberg, MD

Interim Senior Vice President, Publishing & Business:

Robert L. Kennett

Publisher: Peter J. Murphy

Director of Advertising Sales: Stuart H. Williams

ADVERTISING OFFICES—Eastern: 119 Cherry Hill Rd, 3rd Floor, Parsippany, NJ 07054 (Representatives: Susan J. Carolo, Alice H. Herman [973-263-9191]); **Midwest/Farwest:** 515 N State St IL 60610 (Representative: Jeffery J. Bonistall [312-464-2551]); **Classified Advertising:** 312-464-2456

ADVERTISING PRINCIPLES—Advertisements in this issue have been reviewed to comply with the principles governing advertising in AMA publications. A copy of these principles is available on request. The appearance of advertising in AMA publications is not an AMA guarantee or endorsement of the product or the claims made for the product by the manufacturer.

MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION—Send manuscripts to the Editor, George D. Lundberg, MD, JAMA, 515 N State St IL 60610.

All articles published, including editorials, letters, and book reviews, represent the opinions of the authors and do not reflect the official policy of the American Medical Association or the institution with which the author is affiliated, unless this is clearly specified.

Now get the article you need within 24 hours!

Document delivery puts any article from the American Medical Association (AMA) journals at your fingertips, complete with charts, figures and graphics. Articles from any issue of *JAMA* and the *Archives* journals are available, whether they were published last week or even decades ago.

Order by phone, fax or online . . .

A black and white copy of the article will be sent within 24 hours of your order. Articles can be delivered by fax, overnight, and other options. Place your order with the following document delivery services:

The Genuine Article
Institute for Scientific Information
3501 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19104
Phone: 215-386-0100, ext. 1536
Fax: 215-386-4343 and 215-222-0840
e-mail: tga@isinet.com

The Uncover Company
3801 E. Florida Avenue, Suite 200
Denver, CO 80210
Phone: 800-787-7979 or
303-758-3030, ext. 235
Fax: 303-758-5946
e-mail: sos@carl.org

UMI InfoStore
500 Sansome Street, Suite 400
San Francisco, CA 94111
Phone: 800-248-0360 or
415-433-5500, ext. 282
Fax: 415-433-0100
e-mail: orders@infostore.com



Articles available from these journals:

JAMA
Archives of Dermatology • *Archives of Family Medicine*
Archives of General Psychiatry • *Archives of Internal Medicine*
Archives of Neurology • *Archives of Ophthalmology*
Archives of Otolaryngology-Head & Neck Surgery
Archives of Pediatrics & Adolescent Medicine
Archives of Surgery

The Editors and Their Journals

The Reported Training and Experience of Editors in Chief of Specialist Clinical Medical Journals 286
J. Garrow, M. Butterfield, J. Marshall, A. Williamson, London, England

A Comparison of the Opinions of Experts and Readers as to What Topics a General Medical Journal (JAMA) Should Address 288
G. D. Lundberg, Chicago, Ill; M. C. Paul, Princeton, NJ; H. Fritz, Chicago, Ill

Ethical Issues in Studying Submissions to a Medical Journal 290
C. M. Olson, Seattle, Wash; R. M. Glass, Chicago, Ill;
S. B. Thacker, D. F. Stroup, Atlanta, Ga

The News Media and Peer-Reviewed Journals

Peer-Reviewed Articles and Public Health: The Mad Cow Affair in Italian Newspapers 292
E. Girardi, N. Petrosillo, M. S. Aloisi, L. Ravà, G. Ippolito, Rome, Italy

Press Releases of Science Journal Articles and Subsequent Newspaper Stories on the Same Topic 294
V. de Semir, C. Ribas, G. Revuelta, Barcelona, Spain

When Things Go Wrong and Solutions

Phenomena of Retraction: Reasons for Retraction and Citations to the Publications 296
J. M. Budd, M. Sievert, T. R. Schultz, Columbia, Mo

The Journal Ombudsperson: A Step Toward Scientific Press Oversight 298
R. Horton, London, England

Freedom and Responsibility in Medical Publication: Setting the Balance Right 300
D. Rennie, Chicago, Ill

This Week in JAMA 207

The Cover 210

Jacques Villon, *Le Philosophe* M. T. Southgate

The International Congress on Biomedical Peer Review and Global Communications Advisory Board 211

Readers' Guide to JAMA 212 *i*

JAMA 100 Years Ago 302 *d*

The Journal and Its Friends. . . The Journal and the Association.

Classified Advertising and Announcements 305 *a*

Index to Advertisers 305 *j*

JAMA Patient Page: Medical Research 306

Reference Directories

Meetings in the United States . . . International Meetings July 8, 1998
Organizations of Medical Interest July 9, 1997
State Medical Associations and Examinations and Licensure July 23/30, 1997

JAMA Instructions for Authors See July 1, 1998, p 19.

JAMA Reader's Choice: Continuing Medical Education 303